





JUDICIARY AND FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS



NATIONAL RESOURCE CENTRE



Albania's Scorecard On Progress And Level Of Preparation Regarding EU Accession During 2023-2024

This study was conducted by the European Movement in Albania (EMA) in the framework of the project "National Resource Centre for Civil Society in Albania", with the financial support of the European Union through the Delegation of the European Union in Albania. The information and views expressed in this document are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect the official opinion of the European Union.

The National Resource Centre for Civil Society in Albania (NRC) is an initiative of Partners Albania, implemented in partnership with the Albanian Center for Population and Development (ACPD) and the European Movement in Albania (EMA).

November 2024, Tirana

National Resource Centre for Civil Society in Albania is implemented in partnership with Albanian Centre for Population and Development and European Movement in Albania





Albania's Scorecard On Progress And Level Of Preparation Regarding EU Accession During 2023 - 2024

BASED ON THE ASSESSMENTS OF THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION 2023 AND 2024 COUNTRY REPORTS

Context

The European Commission (EC) monitors Albania's progress and level of preparation in meeting EU membership requirements on an annual basis. The country is working on the transposition of the Acquis according to the National Plan on European Integration (NPEI), which serves as a tool for fulfilling the obligations arising from the Stabilization and Association Agreement (SAA). The First Intergovernmental Conference held on July 19, 2022, marked a major milestone for Albania, symbolizing a key technical step in the EU integration process. This conference set the stage for the European Commission's approval of the negotiation framework and initiated the groundwork for the screening process. With the screening process completed in November 2023, Albania reached another significant achievement on October 16, 2024, by officially opening negotiations for Cluster 1 – Fundamentals.

This Scorecard on Albania's Progress and Level of Preparation towards EU membership takes as its starting point the situation described in the EC 2023 Country Report and reflects the development throughout the reporting period crystallized in the EC 2024 Country Report. It aims to display in a more simplified way 1) the Political Criteria 2) Chapter 23 (Judiciary and Fundamental Rights) and 3) Chapter 24 (Justice, Freedom and Security).

The Scorecard presents an assessment concerning the main fields of each chapter. The evaluation includes an elaboration on progress and preparation in each area, as well as a graded assessment (where 10 is the highest grade and 4 the lowest), taking into account the terminology used in each case in the European Commission Reports for progress and level of preparation.

Furthermore, it considers the frequency and the relevance of the issue (new legal initiatives or strategies are generally viewed as more important than routine trainings). Particular attention has been drawn to the evaluation of the implementation of the legislation as one of the most important problems that our country faces. The methodology applied by EMA constitutes a snapshot of several components that shape a subfield, field and then chapter.

TERMINOLOGY USED FOR PROGRESS:	GRADE
Backsliding	4
No progress	5
Limited Progress	6
Some progress	7
Good Progress	8-9
Very good progress	10

TERMINOLOGY USED FOR PREPARATION	GRADE
n/a	n/a
Early stage	5
Some level of preparation	6
Some level / moderately prepared	7
Moderately prepared	8
Good level of preparation	9
Well-advanced	10

How Should We Read This Scorecard?

Albania's Scorecard presents grades for each area analyzed by the European Commission for the preparation level and progress made regarding the European integration process for the reporting period covered by the reports of 2023 and 2024 The evaluation was carried out taking into account several criteria such as:

- Assessment of the fulfillment of requirements and obligations arising from the process concerning the legislation drafting framework;
- Reviewing whether the recommendations of the previous year were taken into consideration;

This document's main objective is to offer civil society actors, academics, governmental bodies, students, businesses and other interested citizens a clear and accurate reading, beyond the political debates, of Albania's progress in all areas that are part of the Copenhagen Criteria for EU membership.

SCORECARD FOR CHAPTER 23: JUDICIARY AND FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS

CHAPTER 23	EC REPORT 2023	EC REPORT 2024	CHANGE
Functioning of the Judiciary	Preparation - Grade: 8 Albania is moderately prepared on the functioning of the judiciary. The Ministry of Justice reports regularly on the implementation of the 2021-2025 cross-sector justice strategy and its action plan. All judicial institutions, have developed plans to align their activities with the cross-sector strategy. Albania needs to ensure effective cooperation between justice institutions. The SoM needs to intensify its efforts to improve the quality of academic staff and to ensure a competitive and transparent recruitment process. The overall quality of the initial and continuous training at the School of Magistrates (SoM) requires further improvement. SPAK, comprising the Special Prosecution Office (SPO) and the National Bureau of Investigation (NBI), continued to be fully operational. The quality of final court decisions need to be further improved. The efficiency of the judicial system and access to justice continued to be affected by the length of proceedings, the increased workload and the large backlog of cases, which remains significant. Attempts to stabilise the backlog have not yet produced results. The courts with the largest backlog are the High Court, the Appeal Court and the Administrative Court of Appeal. It is necessary to improve citizens' awareness of alternative dispute resolution. Implementation of the new judicial map has started.	Preparation – Grade: 8 Albania is moderately prepared on the functioning of the judiciary. Implementation of the Cross- cutting Justice Strategy 2021–2025 still needs to be improved, as both the implementation rate and reporting capacity of the competent judicial institutions are still low. The HJC and the HPC are in place, but their efficiency in appointing, promoting, transferring and evaluating magistrates is very low. Their coordination with the Ministry of Justice, the High Justice Inspector (HJI) and other judicial institutions on key judicial policies and their systemic follow-up to operational conclusions also remains weak. The vetting process has continued and its completion in first instance is imminent, which is a major milestone with 11 remaining cases out of 805 as of 3 October 2024. The independence and impartiality of the judiciary is satisfactory in the higher-level courts, including courts of appeal, and needs to be improved in the courts of first instance. The Councils, the HJI and the HIDAACI should make further efforts in performing thorough asset checks and, background checks on magistrates and candidate-magistrates. The fact that magistrates who have been dismissed through vetting are not prohibited from taking up positions of training staff remains a concern. The new judicial map was implemented, but there are still challenges with the quality and efficiency of justice. Some preparatory acts were adopted on the roll-out of an integrated case management system, but the necessary budget allocations are lacking, especially for the court component.	0
	Progress – Grade: 8 Good progress was made during the reporting period, with the continued implementation of the justice reform. The vetting process for judges and prosecutors has advanced with overall good results. The SPAK achieved further results, and conducted investigations in several high-level	Progress – Grade: 7.5 Albania has made some progress on the functioning of the judiciary. Albania continued implementing the justice reform and the vetting process, which led to significant improvements in the functioning of the judiciary that must be maintained. The satisfactory operation of the HJI	

Functioning of the Judiciary

exert pressure on the judicial system. Progress was made in addressing judicial vacancies through the appointment of a significant number - 40 - of new magistrates. A new Chief Special Prosecutor was elected in December 2022 after a sound process. The roll-out of a modern integrated case management system has been long pending, and it remains necessary to improve the efficiency and transparency of the justice system. However, progress was made with the establishment of the interoperability working group in June 2023 and the adoption of the interoperability framework setting the basis for the roll-out of the system. The High Justice Inspector (HJI) continued to be operational, initiating and conducting disciplinary investigations against magistrates. A robust implementation plan for the new judicial map is still missing and needs to be urgently put in place.

cases, which include the involvement of two former

ministers. However, concerns continued to be

raised about alleged attempts to interfere with and

and the continued good progress in implementing justice reforms have strengthened accountability. On 21 October 2024, the vetting institutions had completed 798 vetting cases at first instance amounting to 99% of the total. The HJC and the HPC's membership was renewed. However, the appointment of non-magistrate members to the Councils had been delayed and remained heavily influenced by Parliament, presenting shortcomings in the background checks and assets verification and meritocracy of the process. The HPC has conducted only one evaluation since the start of the implementation of the 2016 justice reform, which is of concern. There was **no specific progress** in the performance of the School of Magistrates' comprehensive revision of the annual entry exam, the review of initial and continuous training curricula, and the quality and integrity of its staff. Serious delays are experienced with the legal deadlines on publishing the reasoned decisions by courts.

-0.5

CHAPTER 23	EC REPORT 2023	EC REPORT 2024	CHANGE
Fight against corruption	Preparation - Grade: 7 Albania has some level of preparation in the fight against corruption. Albania is party to all international anti-corruption conventions, including the United Nations Convention against Corruption. The vetting of judges and prosecutors continues to bring results in the fight against corruption within the judiciary. Albanian institutions need to ensure systematic judicial follow-up on vetting cases where criminal offences have been indicated. Prosecution services are encouraged to proactively initiate criminal proceedings against judges and prosecutors whose vetting process revealed criminal elements. Corruption remains prevalent in the health and property sectors and within the police. Internal checks and inspection mechanisms in the public administration remain weak and ineffective. The central ministries, all agencies of the Ministry of Justice, and 22 additional municipalities adopted integrity risk assessment and integrity plans. Their effective implementation of the inter-sectoral strategy against corruption is overall on track, although important weaknesses remain. A new strategy for 2023-2030 is in preparation.	Preparation – Grade: 7.5 Albania is between having some level of preparation and a moderate level of preparation. SPAK, comprising the Special Prosecution Office (SPO), the NBI and specialised courts, has continued to deliver good results in high-level corruption cases. The GDAC faces challenges with its efficiency despite its recent transfer to the Ministry of State for Public Administration and Corruption. The thorough verification of assets, especially those concealed through proxy ownership arrangements, is hindered by the administrative boundaries of HIDAACI's mandate. The state police remain highly vulnerable to corruption, and accountability remains weak. The legal framework for the fight against corruption is largely in place, but preventive measures and law enforcement need to be improved institutional roles and coordination for prevention, especially in the areas of conflict of interest, financing of political parties, donations and sponsorships, whistle-blower protection, the fight against fraud, and seizure of assets and their confiscation. Albania needs to promptly and effectively address the outstanding recommendations of GRECO.	+0.5
Fight against corruption	Progress – Grade: 7 Despite some progress and continued efforts in fighting corruption, including a number of high-level convictions and financial investigations at high level it remains an area of serious concern. The 2022 recommendations were only partially implemented, thus they remain valid. In March 2023, GRECO concluded that Albania implemented or dealt satisfactorily with only 5 of the 24 recommendations. Anti- corruption measures continue to have a limited impact, notably in the most affected areas such as infrastructure, property rights, customs, tax, education, health, public procurement and government contracts. Some progress was made in awareness- raising and efforts in this area need to be sustained.	Progress- Grade: 7 Albania has shown some progress in anti- corruption efforts. SPAK's capacity in financial investigations has increased and the systematic use of financial investigations and asset confiscations has improved. Another direct outcome of vetting was registered in September, as the IQC referred 19 vetting cases with <i>prima facie</i> criminal elements to SPAK for judicial follow up. The adoption of a broad criminal amnesty law led to 40 individuals convicted by SPAK courts and being fully pardoned and 65 others having their sentence reduced, which raises concerns. The GPO and the state police, still face challenges in detecting and effectively investigating corruption. The number of whistle-blower reports remains low. Targeted risk assessments and dedigated magaures are peopled to address	0

dedicated measures **are needed** to address corruption in the most vulnerable sectors, including police, customs, land and property management, state cadastre and public

procurement.

CHAPTER 23	EC REPORT 2023	EC REPORT 2024	CHANGE
Fundamental Rights	Preparation – Grade: 7 Albania has not signed the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and the Optional Protocol to the International Convention on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. On the promotion and enforcement of human rights, the Ombudsperson (People's Advocate) continued to exercise their mandate satisfactorily . On the prevention of torture and ill-treatment, the medical and custodial staff in prison hospitals are generally satisfactory . However, poor material conditions still prevail, as well as structural deficiencies. Legislation on the protection of personal data needs to be urgently aligned with the EU General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) and the EU law enforcement Directive. Albania should take urgent measures to prevent the recurrence of massive breaches of personal data and improve their handling. The persistence of child marriage remains a matter of concern . However, since 2021 the government has prioritised addressing child marriage in its budgeted national policy framework.	Preparation – Grade: 7 Albania's legal framework sets out a generally good basis for the protection of fundamental rights. The country has not signed the Optional Protocol to the International Convention on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. Albania needs to develop a comprehensive monitoring and data collection system to assess the level of implementation of human rights legislation, policies, and strategies. Albania faces challenges in implementing ECtHR judgments. There are currently 16 cases under enhanced supervision by the Committee of Ministers, more than double the figure of 2023 (7 in 2023). The Ombudsperson (People's Advocate) continued to exercise its mandate satisfactorily; however, staff shortages persist, affecting the functioning of its regional offices. Conditions for prisoners with mental health issues and forensic patients are a serious concern due to overcrowding, a lack of medical and therapeutic staff and inadequate facilities. Concerns remain about the handling of personal data by private companies and public administrations as well as about the weaknesses of government IT systems. The capacity of the Office of the information and Data Protection Commissioner (IDP) needs to be strengthened.	0
Fundamental Rights	Progress – Grade: 7.5 Overall, Albania continues to be party to most international human rights instruments. Albania continues to ensure good cooperation with the European Court of Human Rights (ECtHR). On the right to life, limited progress was made in investigating cases and strengthening the institutional and legislative framework on persons missing since the communist era. No systemic illtreatment in prisons or by the police has been reported, by the People's Advocate. The prison system and detention centres remain a serious issue of concern. Patients with medical conditions from the Kruja and Zaharia detention facilities were transferred to the Lezha prison, implementing the 2021 recommendations of the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment and the judgments of the ECHR. Progress was made on the use of alternatives to detention and, in particular, the probation service. Overall, freedom of thought, conscience and religion was generally upheld. The restitution of properties belonging to religious groups that were expropriated during the communist era remains an unresolved issue.	Progress – Grade: 7.5 Albania is party to the main international human rights instruments. Progress during the reporting period included the adoption of a new strategy for the protection of crime victims, as well as the preliminary results of the national population and housing census published in June. Albania continues to ensure good cooperation with the ECtHR. The Court found breaches of the European Convention on Human Rights relating mainly to the right to respect for private and family life, the right to a fair trial, and the right to liberty and security. Albania generally complies with its obligations on the prohibition of torture and ill-treatment. The functioning of the National Preventive Mechanism is satisfactory; however, the follow- up of its recommendations remains low. Despite some progress, corruption, poor healthcare and a shortage of staff in the penitentiary system and detention centres remain a concern. The probation service is operational and offers alternatives to imprisonment, including for juvenile offenders. Implementation efforts need to intensify overall, particularly in the areas of violence against women, protection of property rights and rights of persons belonging to minorities.	0

Freedom of Expression	extensive consultations with media organisations and civil society. The provisions of the Criminal Code on insult and defamation need to be repealed or fully aligned with European standards. Limited job security and poor working conditions pose serious risks of self-censorship. Albania is a signatory to the Declaration for the Future of the Internet of April 2022. The national strategy for cybersecurity and its 2020-2025 action plan have been adopted . The strategy includes a chapter on the protection of children online as a priority for the country. The state generally refrains from filtering and blocking online content. Digital media continue to be strongly influenced by political actors, businesses and by third parties in terms of funding and content. Large information technology platforms remain unregulated and unregistered in Albania. Freedom of artistic expression is broadly guaranteed . Laws on hate speech are in line with international standards. Better enforcement and greater awareness raising are needed to eliminate hate speech, particularly in rural and remote areas.	reported cases in 2023 The Criminal Code c special protection for violence, attacks or the their profession. The information is bro European standards; binding deadlines for need to be set base practices. In April 2 established an <i>ad</i> committee on tacklin foreign interference, w the opposition. M continues to be nego the overlap of polit interests in terms of fur high ownership cybersecurity capacity generally weak . S against the media wei reporting period. Jou hardships in terms of human resources and to set up effective of government to prom independent media.
Freedom of Expression	Progress – Grade: 5.5 Limited progress was made, in particular through the amendment of the Law on audiovisual media, to align with the 2018 EU Directive on audiovisual media services. The atmosphere of verbal and physical attacks, smear campaigns and intimidation lawsuits against journalists has not improved. The anti-defamation legal package was removed from Parliament's agenda in November 2022. The Audiovisual Media Authority adopted a revised Audiovisual Broadcasting Code. High-profile business groups further increased their economic penetration in the media market. Market and audience concentration and lack of transparency of media funding continue to remain issues of concern as regards media freedom in the country.	Progress – Grade: 5 Albania made no pro solid track record of pr follow-up has yet to safeguard the safet progress was mad legislative framework including the Media I addressing high mark the transparency of Implementation of th information is weak , d to answers. The Law of lays down limited sa concentration of me monopolies. The statt from filtering and blo However, media free claim that there an
	needon in the country.	provisions to enforce r

EC REPORT 2024

Preparation - Grade: 6.5

EC REPORT 2023

Albania is in between some and moderate

CHAPTER

23

level of preparation in the area of freedom of expression. The constitutional right to freedom of expression continued to be generally upheld. It is essential that any change to the legal framework be in line with European standards, and is subject to

Preparation - Grade: 6.5

Albania is between having some level of preparation and a moderate level of preparation in the area of freedom of expression. The framework for the protection of journalists is in place, but verbal and physical attacks and smear campaigns continued. The use of SLAPP increased to 73 (up from 42 in 2022). **loes not provide** for or journalists against reats while exercising Law on access to adly aligned with however, shorter and answers to journalists ed on best European 2024, the Parliament hoc parliamentary g disinformation and vithout the support of ledia independence atively influenced by tical and businesses nding and content and concentration. The y of media outlets is Several cyberattacks re reported during the irnalists **face serious** limited financial and the limited possibility cooperation with the note the interests of

ogress in this area. A osecution and judicial o be established to y of journalists. **No** te in aligning the with the EU acquis, Freedom Act, also in ket concentration and of media ownership. ne Law on access to due to delaying replies on audiovisual media ifeguards against the edia ownership and te generally refrains ocking online content. eedom organisations e no specific legal net neutrality.

CHANGE

 $\mathbf{0}$

-0.5

CHAPTER 23	EC REPORT 2023	EC REPORT 2024	CHANGE
Gender equality/ non discrimination	Preparation - Grade: 5	Preparation – Grade: 6 The legal and institutional framework for gender equality is partially aligned with the EU acquis. Weaknesses remain in implementing the National Strategy for Gender Equality 2021-2030 and its Action Plan. The application of gender responsive budgeting continued in 2023, with 48 out of 75 budget programmes in 11 line ministries and Central Institutions. The Ombudsperson set up a Femicide Watch to report and monitor cases of femicide. Support services for victims of violence continue to be donor-driven and insufficient, particularly in healthcare, the funding of shelters, free legal aid, and the reintegration and rehabilitation of victims of violence. In 2023, The Commissioner for Protection from Discrimination (CPD) handled six cases of hate speech, confirming hate speech in two of the cases. In 2024, two new cases are under review. Coordination mechanisms need to be significantly improved in the areas of child trafficking, cybercrime, child marriage, child sexual abuse and the right to healthcare and education. The quality of education for children with disabilities, especially children with a hearing impairment, continues to cause concern. Albania does not have legislation recognising civil cohabitation or same-sex marriage. Most of the EGBTIQ National Action Plan 2021-2027 has yet to be implemented. A new cross-cutting Strategy for the Protection of Crime Victims 2024-2030 was approved through a decision of the Council of Ministers. The FCNM's Advisory Committee noted that national minorities have limited opportunities for political participation, particularly at national level, and recommended reviewing the procedures for selecting the members of the Committee on National Minorities. Overall, access to education for the Roma community continues to be problematic, and segregation in schools is still an issue.	0

Progress – Grade: 6

Gender

non

equality/

discrimination

On gender-based violence, the national legal framework needs to be further harmonised with the provisions of the International Labour Organization Convention on Violence and Harassment in the World of Work, ratified in February 2022. The current legal framework is not fully aligned with international standards, including the Istanbul Convention, and lacks focus on the reintegration of, and access to services for, victims and survivors of violence. Some progress was made on the rights of persons with disabilities. Albania's framework legislation on the rights of persons with disabilities remains only partially in compliance with the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and gaps $\ensuremath{\textbf{must}}$ be addressed. Albania needs to ratify the Optional Protocol to the Convention. The application of gender-responsive budgeting has continued to improve. Discrimination against LGBTIQ persons is still very prevalent in Albanian society, especially as regards access to healthcare, education, justice, employment and housing. Limited progress was made on the social inclusion of the Roma and Egyptian minorities. On citizenship rights, there were no new developments.

Progress – Grade: 6

The legal framework for gender-based violence **is not** fully aligned with the Istanbul Convention. Violence against women and girls remains a pressing issue that needs to be addressed. Laws on hate speech are in line with European standards; however, better enforcement capacity and awareness-raising are needed. No progress was made on child-friendly justice. The laws to protect minors from child marriage are generally ineffective or applied inconsistently. The framework legislation on the rights of persons with disabilities is only partially compliant with the UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, and the country has not ratified the Optional Protocol to the UNCRPD. The adoption of the medical protocol for transgender and gender diverse persons is a **positive step** in facilitating the right to healthcare but implementation **not adopted yet** and corresponding legal changes still need to be ensured, including changes to identity documents. There was **no** progress in addressing issues related to the procedural rights of suspects and accused persons. There has been poor implementation of the national action plan for equality, inclusion and participation of Roma and Egyptians in Albania (2021-2025) and the Poznan commitments.

0